

Cross-Sector Analysis of Human Resource Recruitment, Selection, and Placement: A Multi-Site Study in Industrial and Higher Education Organizations

Rahmi Lubis¹, Desi Sintyasari², Hendra Yanuar³, Mita Sumayyah⁴, Mutiara Syalasy Sumasta⁵, Cindy Rahma Wati⁶, Natasha Ashari⁷, Veronika Putri⁸, Iqbal Maulana⁹, Nauli Ricardo Sitorus¹⁰

^{1,2,3,4,5,6,7,8,9,10} Universitas Medan Area, Medan, Indonesia

Article Info

Article history:

Received 2026-05-17

Revised 2026-06-29

Accepted 2026-06-30

Keywords:

Competency-Based Human
Resource Management
Cross-Sector Analysis
Human Resource Placement
Human Resource Recruitment
Human Resource Selection

ABSTRACT

Human resource procurement, encompassing recruitment, selection, and placement, plays a strategic role in ensuring organizational effectiveness. However, these practices vary across organizations due to differences in operational objectives, organizational characteristics, and competency requirements. This study aims to analyze and compare human resource recruitment, selection, and placement practices in three organizations representing the manufacturing, plantation, and higher education sectors. A qualitative multi-site research design was employed involving PT. GA, PT. TS, and the “SD” Higher Education Foundation. Data were collected through observations, semi-structured interviews with 15 informants, and document analysis, and were analyzed using the interactive model of Miles, Huberman, and Saldaña. The findings reveal that each organization implements contextual human resource procurement strategies. PT. GA emphasizes technical competence and operational efficiency, PT. TS prioritizes physical readiness, fieldwork experience, and adaptability, while the “SD” Higher Education Foundation focuses on academic competence, professionalism, and educational quality through competency-based recruitment, selection, and placement. The study also identifies challenges related to competency mismatch, recommendation-based recruitment bias, workforce turnover, and the limited utilization of digital human resource management systems. This study contributes to the human resource management literature by providing a cross-sector perspective that demonstrates how organizational context shapes recruitment, selection, and placement practices. The findings also offer practical implications for developing competency-based and adaptive human resource management systems across different organizational settings.

This is an open-access article under the [CC BY-SA](#) license.



Corresponding Author:

Rahmi Lubis

Magister Psikologi, Konsentrasi Psikologi Industri Organisasi, Universitas Medan Area, Medan, Indonesia

Email: rahmilubis@staff.uma.ac.id

1. INTRODUCTION

Human resources (HR) are a really important asset that determines whether an organization succeeds in achieving its goals effectively and sustainably [1]. Therefore, organizations need to implement professional HR management, especially in the procurement of human resources, which includes recruitment, selection, and employee placement. These three processes are interconnected stages to obtain a workforce that is competent and fits the organization's needs [2].

The implementation of effective HR procurement contributes to increased productivity, job satisfaction, and organizational performance [3]. However, the development of technology, competition for quality workforce, and changing competency needs require organizations to implement more adaptive and competency-based recruitment, selection, and placement systems. Mistakes in these processes can lead to mismatched competencies, high turnover, and decreased organizational performance [4]. Therefore, studying the implementation of HR procurement in various types of organizations becomes important to understand how effectively it is applied according to the characteristics of each organization.

This research was carried out at three institutions with different organizational characteristics, namely the Metal Casting Industry PT. GA, the Rubber Plantation Company PT. TS, and the 'SD' Higher Education Foundation. These three institutions were chosen because they represent the manufacturing, plantation, and higher education sectors, each with different organizational cultures, workforce needs, and job characteristics. These differences allow for variations in strategies and mechanisms for recruitment, selection, and placement of human resources, making it an interesting context to study comprehensively.

Previous research by Nazyrova et al. shows that the recruitment, selection, and placement processes significantly affect organizational effectiveness. A good recruitment and selection system can improve workforce quality, reduce turnover rates, and boost organizational productivity. In addition, placing employees according to their competencies has been proven to increase job satisfaction, organizational commitment, and employee performance [5]. However, previous research by Greenhalgh et al. only looked at HR procurement in one type of organization or a specific sector, like manufacturing, education, or plantations, separately [6]. Besides that, previous research by Gitonga et al. mostly used a quantitative approach that focused on the relationships between variables, so it has not been able to deeply explain the dynamics of processes, policies, and HR procurement implementation in different organizational contexts [7].

Based on that study, there is still a research gap, meaning there are only a few studies comparing the recruitment, selection, and placement processes of human resources across different organizational sectors using a qualitative approach. Also, previous research generally only looks at one aspect of HR procurement, so it has not really given a complete picture of the whole human resource procurement process.

To help fill that gap, this study offers some novelty through a qualitative approach with a multi-site study design across three organizations from the manufacturing, plantation, and higher education sectors. The research combines recruitment, selection, and placement

processes into a single analytical framework while also identifying the factors that support and hinder the effectiveness of HR procurement in each organization.

Based on this background, this study aims to analyze and compare the implementation of recruitment, selection, and placement of human resources in the three organizations, identify their similarities and differences, and analyze the factors that influence the effectiveness of their implementation. The results of this study are expected to enrich human resource management research, especially regarding cross-sector HR procurement, and provide input for organizations in developing more effective, objective, and competency-based recruitment, selection, and placement systems.

2. METHOD

This study uses a qualitative approach with a multi-site study design to gain a deeper understanding of the implementation of recruitment, selection, and placement of human resources in organizations with different characteristics. The multi-site study design was chosen because it allows researchers to compare HR practices across several organizations, revealing similarities, differences, and implementation patterns across sectors [8].

The research was carried out from January to April 2026 at three institutions: the Metal Casting Industry PT. GA, the Rubber Plantation Company PT. TS, and the Higher Education Foundation "SD." These three locations were chosen on purpose because they represent the manufacturing, plantation, and higher education sectors, each with different organizational characteristics, work cultures, and human resource needs.

Research participants were selected using purposive sampling, which involves choosing informants who have knowledge, experience, and direct involvement in the HR procurement process [9]. The number of research informants was 15 people, consisting of 3 organization leaders, 3 HR managers/department heads, 3 personnel department heads, and 6 employees who had gone through the recruitment, selection, and placement process.

The research data consists of primary and secondary data. Primary data is obtained through field observations and semi-structured interviews, while secondary data comes from organizational documents, such as organizational structure, recruitment guidelines, standard operating procedures (SOPs), personnel documents, and other archives related to human resource procurement.

Data collection was carried out over four months through 12 observation activities, 15 in-depth interviews, and document studies. The interviews used a semi-structured guide covering five main indicators: (1) the recruitment process, (2) the selection mechanism, (3) placement policies, (4) supporting and inhibiting factors in HR procurement, and (5) the organization's strategy in improving HR procurement effectiveness. The research instruments included interview guides, observation sheets, document review lists, and field notes, with the researcher as the main instrument.

The validity of the data is ensured through the application of credibility, transferability, dependability, and confirmability. Credibility is achieved through source triangulation, technique triangulation, time triangulation, and member checking with all informants. Transferability is strengthened by providing a detailed description of the

research context, while dependability and confirmability are maintained through documentation of the entire research process (audit trail) and discussions with colleagues.

Data analysis uses the interactive model by Miles, Huberman, and Saldaña, which includes data condensation, data display, and drawing and verifying conclusions. The analysis is done in two stages: single-site analysis to understand the implementation of HR procurement in each organization, and cross-site analysis to compare similarities, differences, and patterns in the implementation of recruitment, selection, and placement of human resources across the three institutions [10].

This research has complied with the principles of research ethics. Before collecting data, all participants were informed about the purpose, benefits, and procedures of the study, and then voluntarily gave their consent (informed consent). Participants' identities were kept confidential by using codes or initials, and all collected data were only used for research purposes and stored securely to protect participants' privacy.

3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

3.1. Results

3.1.1. Human Resource Recruitment in the Industrial and Educational Sectors

The findings indicate that the human resource recruitment systems implemented by PT. GA, PT. TS and the "SD" Higher Education Foundation exhibit distinct characteristics that reflect each organization's operational needs, organizational culture, and competency requirements. These differences are evident in the recruitment orientation, recruitment sources, initial selection mechanisms, and the primary criteria employed to acquire qualified personnel.

At PT. GA, the recruitment process is primarily oriented toward operational efficiency and fulfilling the demand for technical personnel. Recruitment is initiated when production capacity increases, employees need to be replaced, or new divisions are established. Job vacancies are advertised through the company's social media platforms, internal announcements, and employee referrals. Initial screening is conducted rapidly through administrative document verification and brief interviews to meet immediate production requirements. In addition to prior work experience, the company prioritizes applicants who possess technical skills, discipline, and the ability to work effectively in teams. This finding is supported by the Head of Human Resources at PT. GA, who stated:

"We prioritize applicants who already possess basic production skills and relevant work experience because the metal casting industry requires precision and strong technical competencies."

This finding demonstrates that PT. GA's recruitment strategy is designed not only to attract technically competent employees but also to minimize the adaptation period, thereby enabling the company to achieve optimal productivity more quickly. Consequently, operational efficiency serves as the primary consideration throughout the recruitment process.

In contrast, PT. TS adopts a more flexible recruitment system that is tailored to the operational demands of the plantation sector. Most employees are recruited through recommendations from field supervisors and senior workers and are generally drawn from

communities surrounding the plantation area. The company evaluates applicants based on their physical readiness, fieldwork experience, adaptability to the working environment, and loyalty. Although more formal administrative screening procedures have been introduced for several administrative positions, the recruitment process continues to rely predominantly on conventional referral-based practices. A human resources staff member explained:

"Most of our employees are recruited from the surrounding communities because they are already familiar with the working conditions in the plantation environment."

These findings suggest that PT. TS's recruitment approach is strongly influenced by the nature of plantation work, which requires physical endurance, practical field experience, and familiarity with the social and geographical conditions of the workplace. Nevertheless, the heavy reliance on referral-based recruitment may introduce bias into the hiring process if objective competency assessments do not complement it.

Meanwhile, the "SD" Higher Education Foundation implements a more formal and competency-based recruitment system. Recruitment is conducted through social media platforms, the institution's official website, and academic networks. The selection process consists of administrative screening, interviews, competency assessments, and micro-teaching evaluations for prospective lecturers. The principal selection criteria include academic qualifications, professionalism, communication skills, work experience, and alignment between applicants' academic expertise and the institution's needs. The Vice Chair for Human Resources stated:

"The selection of lecturers and educational staff is carried out through administrative screening, interviews, and competency assessments to ensure that applicants' qualifications align with the institution's requirements."

These findings indicate that the recruitment orientation of the "SD" Higher Education Foundation places greater emphasis on academic quality assurance and professionalism as essential components for supporting higher education quality. This approach demonstrates that competency is assessed not only through academic credentials but also through candidates' pedagogical abilities and professional readiness as prospective academic and administrative personnel.

Overall, the observations and interview findings reveal a consistent pattern indicating that the recruitment systems across the three organizations are contextual and shaped by the characteristics of their respective sectors. PT. GA emphasizes technical competencies and production efficiency; PT. TS prioritizes physical readiness, fieldwork experience, and familiarity with the plantation environment, whereas the "SD" Higher Education Foundation focuses on academic competence, professionalism, and educational quality. Beyond highlighting differences in recruitment strategies, the findings also reveal several challenges in human resource management, including the potential for bias within PT. TS's referral-based recruitment system, the risk of competency mismatch when selection procedures are not conducted comprehensively, and the limited utilization of digital recruitment technologies within both the industrial and plantation sectors.

Table 1. Cross Analysis of Human Resource Recruitment Sites

Aspect	PT. GA	PT. TS	"SD" Higher Education Foundation
Recruitment Orientation	Operational efficiency and technical competencies	Physical readiness and fieldwork experience	Professionalism and academic excellence
Recruitment Sources	Social media and internal employee referrals	Local communities surrounding the plantation and employee referrals	Official website, social media, and academic networks
Initial Selection System	Administrative screening and brief interviews	Basic administrative screening and referral-based selection	Administrative screening, interviews, and micro-teaching assessments
Recruitment Characteristics	Fast and structured	Flexible and conventional	Formal and competency-based
Primary Focus	Work productivity	Work endurance, loyalty, and environmental adaptability	Academic competence, professionalism, and educational quality
Challenges	Urgent demand for skilled personnel	Potential bias arising from referral-based recruitment and subjective selection	Ensuring alignment between applicants' competencies and institutional needs

3.1.2. Human Resource Selection in Workforce Procurement

The findings indicate that the human resource selection processes implemented by PT. GA, PT. TS, and the "SD" Higher Education Foundation differ according to each organization's characteristics, the nature of the work, and the competencies required. These differences are reflected in the stages of the selection process, assessment criteria, evaluation methods, and competency standards used to determine applicants' suitability. Observational data, supported by interview findings, reveal that each organization adopts a contextualized selection system designed to recruit personnel who meet its operational requirements and institutional objectives.

At PT. GA, the selection process is conducted systematically through administrative screening, interviews, and practical skills assessments. Evaluation focuses primarily on technical competence, job readiness, discipline, and teamwork. The Head of Production at PT. GA explained:

"The selection process emphasizes technical competence, particularly machine operation and understanding of work procedures, because jobs in the metal casting industry require precision and specialized skills."

This finding suggests that PT. GA's selection system is designed to ensure that newly recruited employees can contribute productively from the beginning of their employment. The practical skills assessment serves as an important mechanism for identifying candidates who possess the technical competencies required for production activities. Nevertheless, the strong emphasis on technical competence may reduce attention to non-technical competencies (soft skills), such as communication, leadership, and adaptability to technological changes within the industry.

In contrast, PT. TS implements a more flexible selection system that emphasizes physical readiness, fieldwork experience, and the ability to adapt to plantation working conditions. In addition to interviews and administrative screening, the company employs a probationary period as part of the evaluation process to directly assess candidates' work performance. The Head of Division at PT. TS stated:

"We prioritize workers who are already accustomed to fieldwork because plantation work requires physical endurance and the ability to adapt to challenging working conditions."

These findings indicate that PT. TS's selection process is closely aligned with the characteristics of plantation work, which demands physical resilience and the capacity to perform effectively in dynamic working environments. The probationary period serves as a valuable evaluation mechanism by allowing the company to assess candidates' actual job performance before confirming permanent employment. However, the predominant reliance on fieldwork experience and internal referrals may increase the risk of competency mismatch if not supported by more standardized and objective competency assessment instruments.

Meanwhile, the "SD" Higher Education Foundation adopts a more formal and structured selection process consisting of administrative screening, interviews, competency assessments, and micro-teaching evaluations for prospective lecturers. Beyond evaluating academic competence, the selection process also considers professionalism, work ethics, communication skills, and compatibility with the institution's organizational culture. The Vice Chair for Human Resources explained:

"The selection process is conducted in several stages to ensure that academic and administrative personnel possess the academic and professional competencies required by higher education standards."

These findings demonstrate that the selection system at the "SD" Higher Education Foundation is primarily oriented toward ensuring human resource quality as a means of supporting excellence in higher education. The comprehensive selection process facilitates the recruitment of academic and administrative staff who meet institutional standards. However, the relatively lengthy selection procedure requires greater time and organizational resources, potentially delaying workforce fulfillment when personnel are urgently needed.

Overall, the observational and interview findings reveal that the selection systems employed by the three organizations are shaped by their respective sectoral characteristics and organizational objectives. PT. GA emphasizes technical competence and operational readiness to improve production efficiency. PT. TS prioritizes physical readiness, fieldwork experience, and adaptability to plantation working conditions. In contrast, the "SD" Higher Education Foundation places greater emphasis on academic competence, professionalism, and educational quality as the primary criteria for determining the suitability of prospective academic and administrative personnel.

In addition to highlighting differences in selection mechanisms, this study also identifies several challenges in human resource management at PT. GA, the principal challenge lies in balancing the urgent demand for labor with a selection process capable of comprehensively evaluating candidates' competencies, at PT. TS, the primary concern is the potential subjectivity associated with assessing fieldwork experience and relying on internal

referrals, which may affect the objectivity of the selection process. At the "SD" Higher Education Foundation, the challenge involves maintaining rigorous selection standards while ensuring the timely recruitment of academic personnel. Furthermore, all three organizations continue to face limitations in optimizing digitally supported selection processes, indicating that the utilization of information technology in human resource management has not yet fully enhanced the efficiency, effectiveness, and transparency of employee selection.

Table 2. Cross-Site Analysis of Human Resource Selection Processes

Aspect	PT. GA	PT. TS	"SD" Higher Education Foundation
Selection Orientation	Technical competencies and operational readiness	Physical endurance and fieldwork experience	Academic competence and professionalism
Selection Methods	Practical skills assessment, administrative screening, and interviews	Interviews, field observation, and probationary period	Administrative screening, interviews, competency assessments, and micro-teaching evaluations
Selection Characteristics	Fast, systematic, and productivity-oriented	Flexible, contextual, and experience-based	Formal, multi-stage, and quality standards-based
Primary Assessment Criteria	Technical skills, discipline, and teamwork	Physical capability, loyalty, and environmental adaptability	Academic competence, communication skills, and professional ethics
Selection Objectives	To enhance organizational productivity	To fulfill the operational needs of the plantation	To ensure the quality of higher education
Supporting Factors	Practical skills assessments aligned with production requirements	Performance evaluation through a probationary period	A multi-stage and standardized selection system
Challenges	Balancing the speed and quality of the selection process	Potential subjectivity and competency mismatch	A relatively lengthy selection process and limited digitalization

3.1.3. Human Resource Placement in Organizations

The findings indicate that the human resource placement processes implemented by PT. GA, PT. TS and the "SD" Higher Education Foundation are determined by organizational needs, employee competencies, and the characteristics of work within their respective sectors. Although all three organizations adhere to the principle of *the right person in the right place*, their placement mechanisms, decision-making criteria, and job adjustment strategies differ according to their organizational objectives and operational characteristics. Observational findings, supported by interview data, reveal that human resource placement serves not only to fill vacant positions but also as a strategic mechanism for enhancing organizational productivity and minimizing the risk of competency mismatch.

At PT. GA, employee placement is based on technical competencies, previous work experience, selection outcomes, and practical skills assessment results obtained during the recruitment process. After placement, employees participate in an orientation program followed by an initial performance evaluation to ensure alignment between individual capabilities and job requirements. The Head of Production at PT. GA explained:

"Employees are assigned according to their competencies and work experience so that the production process can operate optimally."

These findings demonstrate that PT. GA's placement system is primarily oriented toward maximizing production effectiveness. Evaluation during the orientation period serves as an important supporting mechanism because it enables the company to make adjustments when discrepancies between employees' competencies and job requirements are identified. However, rapidly changing production demands may require employees to be reassigned within a relatively short period. Consequently, the organization must maintain a continuous competency development system to preserve productivity and operational effectiveness.

Unlike PT. GA, PT. TS adopts a more flexible placement system that is adjusted to the operational needs of the plantation. Placement decisions consider employees' physical readiness, fieldwork experience, adaptability to environmental conditions, and performance during the probationary period. The Head of Division at PT. TS stated:

"Employees are assigned according to their abilities and physical condition so that they can perform effectively in the field."

These findings indicate that flexibility constitutes the principal strength of PT. TS's placement system allows the company to allocate personnel according to changing operational demands in the plantation environment. On the other hand, such flexibility may also create challenges, as frequent job reassignments can reduce job stability and potentially increase employee turnover if not accompanied by well-defined career development pathways and continuous competency enhancement programs.

Meanwhile, the "SD" Higher Education Foundation implements a more formal and competency-based placement system. Academic staff is assigned according to the alignment of their academic disciplines, areas of expertise, and the needs of individual study programs, whereas administrative personnel are placed based on competencies in administration, information technology, and academic support services. Before assuming their full responsibilities, all employees participate in an orientation program designed to familiarize them with the institution's organizational culture, academic system, and educational service standards. The Vice Chair for Human Resources explained:

"Lecturers are assigned according to their academic expertise and educational background to ensure that the quality of teaching is maintained."

These findings suggest that the placement system at the "SD" Higher Education Foundation is intended to preserve academic quality and institutional professionalism. Alignment between employee competencies and assigned responsibilities constitutes the primary supporting factor for improving instructional quality and academic services. Nevertheless, the limited availability of qualified academics in certain disciplines presents a significant challenge, as it may result in unequal workloads and delay the fulfillment of staffing requirements within specific academic programs.

Overall, the observational and interview findings demonstrate that organizational characteristics and the strategic objectives of each sector shape human resource placement systems. PT. GA assigns employees based primarily on technical competencies to support production efficiency and productivity. PT. TS emphasizes physical readiness, fieldwork experience, and adaptability to ensure smooth plantation operations. In contrast, the "SD"

Higher Education Foundation prioritizes academic competence, professionalism, and alignment between expertise and job responsibilities as key strategies for maintaining the quality of higher education.

In addition to highlighting differences in placement strategies, this study identifies several challenges in human resource management across the three organizations. PT. GA faces difficulties in maintaining competency alignment when production requirements change rapidly. PT. TS encounters the risk of increased employee turnover resulting from its flexible placement practices and the physically demanding nature of plantation work. Meanwhile, the "SD" Higher Education Foundation faces challenges in recruiting academic personnel whose expertise precisely matches the needs of specific study programs. Furthermore, all three organizations continue to experience limitations in the utilization of digital human resource information systems that could support more objective, integrated, and data-driven placement decisions.

Table 3. Cross-Site Analysis of Human Resource Placement

Aspect	PT. GA	PT. TS	"SD" Higher Education Foundation
Placement Orientation	Productivity and technical competence	Physical readiness and operational field requirements	Academic competence and professionalism
Basis for Placement	Technical competencies, work experience, and practical skills assessment results	Fieldwork experience, physical readiness, and adaptability	Academic discipline alignment, professional competencies, and study program requirements
Placement System	Systematic and performance evaluation-based	Flexible, contextual, and responsive to operational needs	Formal, structured, and based on academic quality standards
Job Adjustment Mechanism	Orientation program and initial performance evaluation	Probationary period and field performance evaluation	Organizational orientation and academic mentoring
Placement Objectives	To enhance production effectiveness and productivity	To support the operational effectiveness of plantation activities	To maintain the quality of higher education
Supporting Factors	Competency evaluation and job orientation	Flexible placement aligned with operational requirements	Alignment between competencies and job responsibilities, supported by orientation programs
Challenges	Changing production demands and the risk of competency mismatch	Employee turnover risk, adaptation to fieldwork conditions, and job rotation	Limited availability of qualified personnel in specialized fields and the underutilization of digital placement systems

3.2. Discussion

3.2.1. Human Resource Recruitment in the Industrial and Educational Sectors

Research findings show that human resource recruitment practices at PT. GA, PT. TS and the 'SD' Higher Education Foundation are contextual, meaning they are influenced

by organizational characteristics, operational goals, and the competencies needed in each sector. These differences highlight that recruitment strategies cannot be standardized across all organizations because each sector has different work environments, organizational cultures, and competency requirements. These findings align with the human resource management theory proposed by Stan and colleagues, which states that recruitment is a strategic process to attract individuals with competencies that match the organization's needs, enabling them to effectively support the organization's goals [11].

In the manufacturing sector, PT. GA implements recruitment focused on operational efficiency by prioritizing technical skills, work experience, and the readiness of candidates to engage in the production process immediately. This strategy shows that the company uses a person-job fit approach, which means matching individual competencies with job requirements as the main basis for hiring. According to Akash & Khan, this approach can boost productivity, shorten adaptation time, and cut down initial training costs [12]. The findings of this study are also consistent with the empirical research by Bartleet et al., which shows that manufacturing companies tend to prioritize technical competence because it is directly related to production process efficiency and achieving operational targets [13].

Unlike the manufacturing sector, PT. TS uses a more flexible recruitment strategy by prioritizing physical readiness, fieldwork experience, and understanding of plantation environment characteristics. Using recommendations from foremen or senior workers shows that the organization leverages social capital as one of its sources for hiring workers. From Gesell et al.'s perspective, this strategy can speed up meeting labor needs because potential employees already have an initial understanding of the organization's work culture [14].

However, the results of this study also show that this approach could potentially cause bias in the recruitment process if it is not backed by an objective competency assessment system. This finding aligns with research by Sukenda et al., which explains that recommendation-based recruitment systems can indeed boost employee loyalty and retention, but at the same time, they might reduce transparency and create opportunities for competency mismatches [15].

Meanwhile, the 'SD' Higher Education Foundation implements a more formal recruitment system through administrative selection, interviews, competency tests, and micro-teaching. The emphasis on academic competence, professionalism, communication skills, and field relevance shows that the educational organization prioritizes human resource quality as a key factor in maintaining education standards. These findings support Langer et al.'s view that human resource quality is a strategic asset in educational organizations because it directly affects the quality of academic services [16]. This research finding is also in line with Rukh's study, which found that recruitment processes based on academic competency can improve the quality of learning, lecturer professionalism, and the performance of higher education institutions [17].

When compared across sectors, this study shows that differences in recruitment practices are not only due to variations in the type of organization but also because of the different strategic orientations of each sector. Manufacturing organizations focus more on production efficiency through technical skills mastery, plantation organizations prioritize physical readiness and the ability to adapt to the work environment, while educational

organizations are oriented towards academic quality and professionalism. In this way, this study expands on the concept of strategic human resource management, which states that recruitment practices should be aligned with the organization's strategy (strategic alignment) in order to achieve sustainable competitive advantage.

In addition to confirming HRM theories, this study also identifies several challenges faced in recruitment practices across the three sectors at PT. GA, the main challenge is balancing the need for quick staffing with the quality of the selection process to ensure technical competence at PT. TS, relying on internal recommendations, can lead to selection bias and competency mismatches if not supported by objective assessment tools. Meanwhile, the SD Higher Education Foundation faces challenges in recruiting educators with academic competencies that match program needs amid increasing competition for quality human resources. Additionally, all organizations still face limitations in using digital technology for recruitment processes, so the effectiveness, transparency, and accuracy of decision-making are not yet optimal.

The main contribution of this research lies in its cross-sector perspective. Unlike most previous studies that only looked at recruitment practices in one type of organization, this study shows that recruitment strategies result from the interaction between organizational characteristics, work culture, required competencies, and operational goals. These findings have theoretical implications, suggesting that human resource management models are not universal, but should be developed contextually according to the characteristics of each sector. On the practical side, the research results recommend that organizations need to build a more adaptive recruitment system by implementing competency-based selection, digitizing the recruitment process, reducing potential biases in recommendation systems, and regularly evaluating the effectiveness of recruitment strategies to be able to produce quality and competitive human resources.

3.2.2. Human Resource Selection in Workforce Procurement

Research findings show that the human resource selection process at PT. GA, PT. TS and the SD Higher Education Foundation are carried out using different mechanisms according to the characteristics of the organization, operational goals, and the competencies needed in each sector. These differences emphasize that the selection process is part of the strategic human resource management function and cannot be applied uniformly across all organizations. Selection is the process of choosing individuals who have the knowledge, skills, abilities, and characteristics that best match the organization's needs, so they can improve work effectiveness. This view is supported by Berman et al., who state that an effective selection system must be aligned with the organization's strategy (strategic human resource management) to generate sustainable competitive advantage [18].

At PT. GA research shows that the selection process is carried out through administrative stages, interviews, and practical tests focused on technical competency. The emphasis on machine operation skills, understanding work procedures, discipline, and teamwork abilities indicates that the company applies a person-job fit approach, which means matching individual competencies with job demands is the main basis in the selection process. Khan & Dhanekula explain that this approach can boost organizational productivity

because it can reduce work errors, speed up the adaptation process, and cut training costs [19].

The findings of this study also align with the results of research by Cureton et al., who found that manufacturing companies focus more on testing technical competence through practical exams because technical skills are directly related to production efficiency and the quality of work [20]. However, this study shows that focusing too much on technical skills can potentially reduce attention to non-technical (soft) skills, like communication, leadership, and adapting to industry technology changes. This suggests that organizations need to implement a more comprehensive selection system to produce a workforce that is not only technically skilled but also has the interpersonal abilities to support teamwork.

Unlike the manufacturing sector, PT. TS implements a more contextual selection process that prioritizes physical readiness, field work experience, and the ability to adapt to plantation environments. Using a probation period as part of the selection process shows that the company does not just assess competence based on interviews or administrative documents, but also by observing the actual performance of candidates in the field. This approach aligns with Hasan & Nijhum's view that organizations with jobs that have high operational risks need performance-based selection methods so that decisions can be made more objectively [21].

This finding also supports the research by Gnanasekaran et al., which states that direct evaluation during the trial period can provide a more accurate picture of a prospective employee's work ability compared to just relying on interview results [22]. However, this study also found that using field work experience and internal recommendations as the main indicators for selection could lead to competency mismatches and subjectivity if not supported by standardized competency assessment tools. Therefore, organizations need to develop a competency-based evaluation system so that the selection process is more transparent, accountable, and fair.

Meanwhile, the 'SD' Higher Education Foundation implements a more formal selection process through stages of administrative screening, interviews, competency tests, and micro-teaching. Unlike the previous two organizations, the selection process at educational institutions not only assesses technical skills in the relevant field, but also pedagogical competence, professionalism, work ethics, communication skills, and fit with organizational culture. These findings support the theory by Riebe et al., which states that human resource quality is a key factor in determining the quality of educational organizations [23].

In addition, Drucker & Kayanan found that implementing selection based on academic competence can improve the quality of learning, lecturer professionalism, and the performance of higher education institutions [24]. Even so, this study found that a multi-layered selection process takes more time, money, and resources, which can slow down meeting the need for educators when institutions face a shortage of human resources in certain areas. Therefore, using digital technology in the selection process becomes one way to improve efficiency without lowering the quality of the evaluation process.

When compared across sectors, the research results show that differences in selection mechanisms are not solely influenced by the type of organization, but are more determined

by the organization's strategy in achieving its operational goals. PT. GA prioritizes technical competence to support production efficiency and productivity, PT. TS focuses on physical readiness and adaptability to ensure smooth plantation operations, while the 'SD' Higher Education Foundation emphasizes academic competence and professionalism as an effort to maintain the quality of higher education. These findings reinforce McDonagh et al.'s concept of strategic fit in human resource management, which states that the effectiveness of a selection system depends on the alignment between HR management strategies and the characteristics of the organization [25].

In addition to confirming HRM theories, this study also provides an empirical contribution to the development of human resource selection studies through a cross-sector perspective. Most previous studies have only focused on one type of organization, so they have not been able to explain how organizational context influences the design of selection systems. This research shows that selection mechanisms in the manufacturing, plantation, and education sectors have different orientations because they're influenced by job characteristics, organizational culture, and the strategic goals of each institution. Therefore, this study broadens the understanding of the importance of applying selection systems that are contextual and adaptive, rather than using a one-size-fits-all approach for all organizations.

From a practical standpoint, this study identifies several challenges that need attention in human resource management at PT. GA, the main challenge is balancing the speed of the selection process with the quality of competency assessments at PT. TS, the biggest challenge lies in the potential subjectivity of using internal recommendations and the risk of competency mismatch if competency evaluations are not carried out comprehensively. Meanwhile, the SD Higher Education Foundation faces challenges in maintaining high selection standards without reducing the efficiency of meeting the needs for teaching staff. In addition, all three organizations still face limitations in utilizing digital-based selection systems that could improve objectivity, transparency, and decision-making accuracy. Therefore, integrating information technology, implementing competency-based assessments, and regularly evaluating the effectiveness of the selection system are important practical implications for improving the quality of human resource management in various organizational sectors.

3.2.3. Human Resource Placement in Organizations

Research results show that the practice of placing human resources at PT. GA, PT. TS, and the 'SD' University Foundation is carried out based on organizational characteristics, operational needs, and the competencies required in each sector. Even though all three organizations apply the principle of the right person in the right place, the way placements are implemented shows differences influenced by organizational goals, work culture, and job characteristics.

This finding reinforces the view of Volanakis et al. that placement is a strategic part of human resource management aimed at creating a match between individual competencies and job demands so that it can improve organizational effectiveness [26]. In line with that, Akter emphasizes that placement decisions should consider the alignment between employee

competencies, organizational needs, and long-term strategy to be able to produce optimal performance [27].

At PT. GA, placement is done based on technical competence, work experience, and the results of selection and practical tests. Orientation programs and initial evaluations serve as a way to make sure employees' skills match the job demands in the manufacturing environment. This approach shows that the company applies the concept of person-job fit, meaning they place individuals according to their technical abilities so that productivity can be achieved from the start of their employment. According to Zhu et al., the match between an individual's skills and the job contributes to increased productivity, fewer work mistakes, and faster employee adaptation [28].

The findings of this study are also consistent with Turpin & Shier's research, which shows that manufacturing companies that implement placement based on technical competencies have higher operational efficiency compared to companies that only consider tenure [29]. However, this study found that the dynamics of production needs cause companies to have to make periodic adjustments in placement. This condition indicates that placement cannot be seen as a static decision, but rather as a process that requires ongoing evaluation to ensure competency alignment is maintained as organizational needs change.

Unlike the manufacturing sector, PT. TS uses a more flexible placement system by taking into account physical readiness, field work experience, adaptability, and performance evaluations during the probation period. The nature of work in the plantation sector, influenced by environmental conditions and production seasons, requires a more dynamic placement system compared to manufacturing. This finding supports Casey & Delaney's view that organizations operating in rapidly changing work environments require flexibility in human resource management to keep workforce distribution aligned with operational needs [30].

This research finding is also in line with Lough's study, which shows that field-based evaluation placements can improve work effectiveness because the organization can assess employees' actual abilities before assigning permanent positions [31]. Even so, this study found that placement flexibility also comes with consequences, like a higher risk of turnover, burnout, and career path uncertainty if a clear competency development and career planning system is not backed by it. So, placement flexibility needs to be balanced with HR development policies that can keep employees motivated and retained.

Meanwhile, the 'SD' Higher Education Foundation implements a more formal placement system by aligning the field of study, professional competence, and program needs. In addition to considering academic qualifications, the institution also provides an orientation program to introduce organizational culture, academic systems, and education service standards. This approach shows that the education organization applies the concept of person-organization fit, which is the alignment between an individual's competence and the values, culture, and goals of the institution. According to Raj, placing educators based on academic competence and professionalism is an important factor in maintaining the quality of education services [32].

The findings of this study are supported by research from Iskandar et al., who concluded that placing lecturers according to their field of expertise positively affects the

quality of learning, academic productivity, and student satisfaction [33]. However, this study also shows that limitations in human resources in certain fields of knowledge still pose a challenge for higher education institutions, especially in meeting the needs of continuously developing study programs. Therefore, more strategic planning of educator requirements becomes an important aspect in supporting the sustainability of education quality.

When compared across sectors, this study shows that human resource placement practices are influenced not just by the type of organization, but also by the strategic orientation it aims to achieve. In the manufacturing sector, placement is directed at boosting production efficiency through matching technical competencies. In the plantation sector, placement is more focused on operational flexibility and the ability to adapt to field working conditions. Meanwhile, in higher education, placement serves to maintain academic quality by matching professional competencies with job roles. These findings reinforce the concept of strategic human resource management, which emphasizes that the effectiveness of HR practices largely depends on aligning HR policies with the organization's strategy. Thus, placement is no longer seen just as an administrative activity, but as a strategic tool that supports achieving the organization's competitive edge.

Compared to previous studies that generally only looked at placement practices in a single sector, this research offers a new contribution through a cross-sector perspective. The study shows that differences in organizational characteristics lead to different approaches to placement, both in terms of basic decision-making, evaluation mechanisms, and the strategic goals aimed for. These findings expand our understanding of human resource placement theory by showing that placement effectiveness is determined not only by individual competency fit but also by the organization's ability to adapt its placement system to the operational context it faces. Therefore, this study provides a conceptual contribution to the development of a more adaptive and contextual HRM theory, while also enriching the literature on the implementation of human resource practices in the manufacturing, plantation, and higher education sectors.

The practical implications of this research show that every organization needs to develop a placement system based on competencies while being adaptable to changes in the work environment. PT. GA needs to strengthen its competency development programs to be able to anticipate changes in production needs. PT. TS needs to build a career development and employee retention system to reduce the risk of turnover due to flexible placement patterns. Meanwhile, the SD Higher Education Foundation needs to strengthen faculty planning based on workload analysis and expand the use of human resource information systems to support more objective, efficient, and data-driven placements. Overall, integrating digital technology, continuous competency assessments, and regular evaluations of placement effectiveness are strategic steps that can improve the quality of human resource management across different organizational sectors.

4. CONCLUSION

This study concludes that human resource recruitment, selection, and placement practices are contextual and vary according to organizational characteristics, operational objectives, and competency requirements. PT. GA emphasizes technical competence and

operational efficiency, PT. TS prioritizes physical readiness and fieldwork adaptability, while the “SD” Higher Education Foundation focuses on academic competence and professionalism. These findings indicate that effective human resource procurement should be aligned with the organizational context rather than applying a universal approach. This study contributes to the human resource management literature by providing a cross-sector perspective, demonstrating how organizational context shapes workforce procurement strategies across manufacturing, plantation, and higher education sectors. Practically, the findings suggest that organizations should implement competency-based and adaptive human resource systems supported by digital technologies to improve transparency, efficiency, and decision-making. This study is limited to three organizations and employs a qualitative multi-site approach; therefore, the findings cannot be generalized to all organizational contexts. Future research is recommended to involve more diverse sectors, apply mixed-methods or longitudinal designs, and examine the effects of digital human resource management and competency-based practices on organizational performance and employee retention.

REFERENCES

- [1] B. Gerhart and J. Feng, "Journal of Management," *The Resource-Based View of the Firm, Human Resources, and Human Capital: Progress and Prospects*, vol. 47, no. 7, pp. 1796-1819, 2021.
 - [2] L. d. Silva, R. Soltovski, J. Pontes, F. Treinta, P. Leitão, E. Mosconi, L. d. Resende and R. Yoshino, "Human resources management 4.0: Literature review and trends," *Computers & Industrial Engineering*, vol. 168, no. 1, p. 108111, 2022.
 - [3] P. Apascaritei and M. M. Elvira, "Dynamizing human resources: An integrative review of SHRM and dynamic capabilities research," *Human Resource Management Review*, vol. 32, no. 4, p. 100878, 2022.
 - [4] P. Budhwar, S. Chowdhury, G. Wood, H. Aguinis, G. J. Bamber, J. R. Beltran, P. Boselie, F. L. Cooke, S. Decker, A. DeNisi, P. K. Dey, D. Guest, A. J. Knoblich, A. Malik, J. Paauwe and S. Papag, "Human resource management in the age of generative artificial intelligence: Perspectives and research directions on ChatGPT," *Human Resource Management Journal*, vol. 33, no. 3, pp. 606-659, 2023.
 - [5] A. Nazyrova, M. Miłosz, G. Bekmanova, A. Omarbekova, G. Aimicheva and Y. Kadyr, "The Digital Transformation of Higher Education in the Context of an AI-Driven Future," *sustainability*, vol. 17, no. 22, p. 9927, 2025.
 - [6] T. Greenhalgh, S. E. Shaw, A. A. Nishio, A. Booth, R. Byng, A. Clarke, F. Dakin, R. Davies, S. Faulkner, N. Hemmings, L. Husain, A. Kalin, E. Ladds, L. Moore, R. Rosen, S. Rybczynska-Bunt and J. Whert, "Protocol: Remote care as the ‘new normal’? Multi-site case study in UK general practice," *NIHR Open Res*, vol. 8, no. 2, p. 46, 2022.
 - [7] M. A. Gitonga, N. R. Wahome and K. J. Njogu, "Influence of Environmental Education in Fostering Sustainable Tourism in South-Eastern Kenya," *African Journal of Education, Science and Technology (AJEST)*, vol. 8, no. 2, p. 103–114, 2025.
 - [8] J. W. Creswell, *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches* (4th ed.), Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications, 2024.
 - [9] Sugiyono, *Metode penelitian kuantitatif, kualitatif, dan R&D*, Bandung: Alfabeta, 2024.
 - [10] M. B. Miles, A. M. Huberman and J. Saldaña, *Qualitative data analysis: A methods sourcebook* (3rd ed.), Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications., 2024.
 - [11] I. E. Stan, D. D’Auria and P. Napoletano, "A Systematic Literature Review of Innovations, Challenges, and Future Directions in Telemonitoring and Wearable Health Technologies," *IEEE Journal of Biomedical and Health Informatics*, vol. 30, no. 3, pp. 2630 - 2645, 2026.
 - [12] M. A. S. Akash and M. A. A. Khan, "Data-Driven Ergonomic Risk Analysis Using Wearable Sensor Networks and Deep Learning for Injury Prevention in Industrial Workplaces," *American Journal of Data Science and Analytics*, vol. 3, no. 6, pp. 1-39, 2022.
-

- [13] B.-L. Bartleet, S. Woodland, N. Sunderland and S. O'Sullivan, "An ecological approach to mapping remote creative practices: insights from an Australian Desert region," *Cultural Trends*, vol. 31, no. 1, pp. 68-87, 2022.
- [14] S. B. Gesell, S. W. Coleman, L. H. Mettam, A. M. Johnson, M. E. Sissine and P. W. Duncan, "How engagement of a diverse set of stakeholders shaped the design, implementation, and dissemination of a multicenter pragmatic trial of stroke transitional care: The COMPASS study," *Journal of Clinical and Translational Science*, vol. 5, no. 1, p. 60, 2021.
- [15] E. Sukenda, A. Affandi and Y. Koesworodjati, "Digital and Collaborative Marketing Strategy for Palutungan Camping Ground Based Tourism Development," *Jurnal Ilmiah Manajemen Kesatuan*, vol. 13, no. 4, p. 2967–2978, 2025.
- [16] J. Langer, M. Siciliano and K. LeRoux, "Applying the Repertory Grid Technique to Advance Nonprofit Collaboration: A Situational Theory of Partner Selection," *Voluntas: International Journal of Voluntary and Nonprofit Organizations*, vol. 34, no. 2, pp. 402 - 417, 2023.
- [17] S. Rukh, O. B. Seyi-Lande and S. T. Oziri, "A Model for Advancing Digital Inclusion through Business Analytics and Partnerships," *Gyanshauryam International Scientific Refereed Research Journal (GISRRJ)*, vol. 6, no. 5, pp. 661-700, 2023.
- [18] G. Berman, N. Goyal and M. Madaio, "A Scoping Study of Evaluation Practices for Responsible AI Tools: Steps Towards Effectiveness Evaluations," *CHI Conference on Human Factors in Computing Systems*, vol. 29, no. 4, pp. 1-24, 2024.
- [19] F. Khan and A. Dhanekula, "Digital Compliance Frameworks For Strengthening Financial-Data Protection And Fraud Mitigation In U.S. Organizations," *Review of Applied Science and Technology*, vol. 4, no. 4, p. 156–194, 2025.
- [20] C. Cureton, T. E. Peters, S. Skelly, C. Carlson, T. C. T. Conway, N. Tautges, A. Reser and N. R. Jordan, "Towards a practical theory for commercializing novel continuous living cover crops: a conceptual review through the lens of Kernza perennial grain, 2019–2022," *Agroecology and Ecosystem Services*, vol. 7, no. 1, pp. 1-17, 2023.
- [21] R. Hasan and A. M. Nijhum, "Ai Applications In Emerging Tech Sectors: A Review Of Ai Use Cases Across Healthcare, Retail, And Cybersecurity," *American Journal of Scholarly Research and Innovation*, vol. 2, no. 2, p. 336–372, 2023.
- [22] V. Gnanasekaran, T. G. Nilsen and P. E. Heegaard, "A Comparative Study of Security Operations Center Models for Operational Technology," *NIKT*, vol. 37, no. 3, pp. 1-16, 2025.
- [23] T. Riebe, M.-A. Kaufhold and C. Reuter, "The Impact of Organizational Structure and Technology Use on Collaborative Practices in Computer Emergency Response Teams: An Empirical Study," *Proceedings of the ACM on Human-Computer Interaction*, vol. 2, no. 2, pp. 1-30, 2021.
- [24] J. Drucker and C. M. Kayanan, "Innovation Districts: Assessing Their Potential as a Strategy for Urban Economic Development," *Urban Affairs Review*, vol. 60, no. 3, pp. 1-16, 2023.
- [25] S. T. McDonagh, C. Reburn, J. R. Smith and C. E. Clark, "Group-delivered interventions for lowering blood pressure in hypertension: a systematic review and meta-analysis," *British Journal of General Practice*, vol. 75, no. 3, pp. 266-276, 2025.
- [26] A. Volanakis, C. Seymour and K. Fouseki, "Assessing the Long-COVID Impact on Heritage Organisations," *Heritage*, vol. 7, no. 6, pp. 3211-3247, 2024.
- [27] M. Akter, "Impact Of Predictive Machine Learning Models On Operational Efficiency And Consumer Satisfaction In University Dining Services. Asrc," *Procedia: Global Perspectives in Science and Scholarship*, vol. 1, no. 1, pp. 376-403, 2025.
- [28] E. M. Zhu, M. Buljac-Samardžić, K. Ahaus and R. Huijsman, "Transforming dementia research into practice: a multiple case study of academic research utilization strategies in Dutch Alzheimer Centres," *Health Research Policy and Systems*, vol. 23, no. 3, pp. 1-18, 2025.
- [29] A. Turpin and M. L. Shier, "Social Entrepreneurial Orientation in Human Service Organizations: A Scoping Review," *Human Service Organizations: Management, Leadership & Governance*, vol. 44, no. 2, pp. 144-168, 2020.
- [30] C. Casey and H. Delaney, "The effort of partnership: Capacity development and moral capital in partnership for mutual gains," *Economic and Industrial Democracy*, vol. 43, no. 1, pp. 63-77, 2019.
- [31] B. J. Lough, "Decentering social innovation: the value of dispersed institutes in higher education," *Social Enterprise Journal*, vol. 18, no. 1, p. 12–27, 2022.

-
- [32] M. W. Z. Raj, "The Role Of Data Science In Optimizing Project Efficiency And Innovation In U.S. Enterprises," *International Journal of Business and Economics Insights*, vol. 5, no. 3, p. 586–600.
- [33] T. Iskandar, M. Mesiono and M. Sit, "Strategies and Challenges in Teacher Development: A Comparative Multi-site Study in Indonesian Higher Education," *AL-ISHLAH: Jurnal Pendidikan*, vol. 17, no. 4, pp. 6510-6521, 2025.
-